

# ABORIGINAL PEOPLES AND CANADIAN LAW

Volume One: Aboriginal Rights and Title

Darlene Johnston
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

**Fall 2005** 

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP - 2 2005

FACULTY OF LAW UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

#### ABORIGINAL PEOPLES AND CANADIAN LAW

Volume One: Aboriginal Rights and Title

Darlene Johnston
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Fall 2005

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.



#### **CONTENTS**

### PART I. ABORIGINAL RIGHTS AND TITLE

# 1. Aboriginal Visions of Land

| James (Sakej) Youngblood Henderson, Majorie L. Benson, Isobel M. Findlay, Aboriginal Tenure in the Constitution of Canada (Carswell, 2000) pp.406-412   |
|---|
| People on Place: The Anishinabek Creation Story4  |
| Kah-Ge-Ga-Gah-Bowh (George Copway), The Life, History, and Travels of Kah-Ge-Ga-Gah-Bowh (Albany: Weed and Parsons, 1847)                               |
| 2. Joining Hands with the British   |
| Alexander Henry, Travels & Adventures In Canada and the Indian Territories Between the Years 1760 and 1776. (New York: Burt Franklin, 1901) pp. 33-4710 |
| Royal Proclamation, 1763  |
| Sketch of Wampum Belts Delivered at Niagara 1764  |
| English Rendition of the Treaty of Niagara  |
| Anishinabek Rendition of the Treaty of Niagara20  |
| Speech of Lieutenant-Governor Simcoe to the Western Indians, June 22nd, 179322  |
| Petition of Chippewa Indians to the British Government 1849   |
| Text of the Robinson-Huron Treaty dated September 9, 1850   |
| 3. Chief Justice Marshall's Legacy  |
| Johnson and Graham's Lessee v. William M'Intosh (1823) 21 U.S. 543 (U.S.S.C.)30   |
| 4. Lord Watson's Legacy   |
| Minutes of Treaty No.3  |
| Text of Treaty No.3   |
| St. Catherine's Milling Co. v. Queen (1888), 14 A.C. 46 (P.C.)  |

# 5. Bringing Marshall's Doctrine Home

| Regina v. White And Bob (1964) 50 D.L.R. (2d) 613                         | 55  |
|---|-----|
| Calder v. Attorney-General of British Columbia (1973), 34 D.L.R. (3d) 145 | 78  |
| 6. Lord Watson's Doctrine Resuscitated                                    |     |
| Smith v. The Queen et al. (1983) 147 D.L.R. (3d) 237                      | 93  |
| Guerin v. Canada, [1984] 2 S.C.R. 335                                     | 109 |
| 7. Constitutionalizing Rights   |     |
| R. v. Jack and Charlie, [1985] 2 S.C.R. 332                               | 113 |
| R. v. Sparrow, [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1075                                       | 120 |
| R. v. Van der Peet, [1996] 2 S.C.R. 507                                   | 140 |
| R. v.Gladstone, [1996] 2 S.C.R. 723                                       | 212 |
| R. v. Adams, [1996] 3 S.C.R. 101  | 257 |
| R. v. Côté, [1996] 3 S.C.R. 139   | 275 |
| Mitchell v. M.N.R., [2001] 1 S.C.R. 911                                   | 302 |
| R. v. Powley, [2003] 2 S.C.R. 207   | 331 |
| 8. Constitutionalizing Title  |     |
| Delgamuukw v. British Columbia [1997] 3 S.C.R. 1010                       | 345 |
| R. v. Marshall: R.v. Bernard. 2005 SCC 43                                 | 386 |

Digitized by the Internet Archive in 2018 with funding from University of Toronto

#### People on Place: The Anishinabek Creation Story

Origin stories say a great deal about how people understand their place in the universe and their relationship to other living things. The dominant creation story of the Europeans who migrated to North America is found in Chapter One of the King James' version of the Book of Genesis:

- 27. So God created man in his *own* image, in the image of God created he him; male and female created he them.
- 28. And God blessed them, and God said unto them, Be fruitful, and multiply, and replenish the earth, and subdue it: and have dominion over the fish of the sea, and over the fowl of the air, and over every living thing that moveth upon the earth.

Man is seen as the pinnacle of creation. After the Fall, Man is set to rule over Woman, and to till the cursed ground. Subjection abounds. Out of this hardship, a division of lands and labour emerges. Both agriculture and this origin story travel northward to flourish in Europe and England.

We have seen how Blackstone relies upon this creation story to justify the existence of private property, "that sole and despotic dominion which one man claims and exercises over the external things of the world, in total exclusion of the right of any other individual in the universe."

This story, although widely travelled, is not universal. The Anishinabek peoples indigenous to the Great Lakes, have their own creation story. The centre of Anishinabek creation is not Eden but Michilimakinac, an island in the strait which separates Lake Huron from Lake Michigan. The earliest recorded version of this story is found in the memoirs of Nicolas Perrot, a French colonial official who travelled throughout the Great Lakes region in the late 1600's. Portions of his memoir, including the creation story, were translated and published by E.H. Blair in *The Indian Tribes of the Upper Mississippi and the Region of the Great Lakes* (Cleveland: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1911):

... They believe that before the world was created there was nothing but water; that upon this vast extent of water floated a great wooden raft, upon which were all the animals, of various kinds, which exist on earth; and the chief of these, they say, was the Great Hare. He looked about for some spot of solid ground where they could land; but as nothing could be seen on the water save swans and other river-birds, he began to be discouraged. He saw no other hope than to induce the beaver to dive, in order to bring up a little soil from the bottom of the water; and he assured the beaver, in the name of all the animals, that if he returned with even one grain of soil, he would produce from it land sufficiently spacious to contain and feed all of them. But the beaver tried to excuse himself from this undertaking, giving as his reason that he had already dived in the neighborhood of the raft without finding there any indication of a bottom. Nevertheless, he was so urgently pressed to attempt again this great enterprise that he took the risk of it and dived. He remained so long without coming to the surface that those who had entreated him to go believed that he was drowned; but finally he was seen appearing, almost dead, and motionless. Then all the other animals, seeing that he was in no condition to climb upon the raft, immediately exerted themselves to drag him up on it; and after they had carefully examined his claws and tail they found nothing thereon.

Their slight remaining hope of being able to save their lives induced them to address the otter, and entreat him to make another effort to search for a little soil at the bottom of the

water. They represented to him that he would go down quite as much for his own welfare as for theirs; the otter yielded to their just expostulations. He remained at the bottom longer than the beaver had done, and returned to them in the same condition as the latter, and with as little result.

The impossibility of finding a dwelling-place where they could maintain themselves left them nothing more to hope for; when the muskrat proposed that, if they wished, he should go to try to find a bottom, and said that he also believed that he could bring up some sand from it. The animals did not depend much on this undertaking, since the beaver and the otter, who were far stronger than he, had not been able to carry it out; however, they encouraged him to go, and even promised that he should be ruler over the whole country if he succeeded in accomplishing his plan. The muskrat then jumped into the water, and boldly dived; and, after he remained there for nearly twenty-four hours he made his appearance at the edge of the raft, his belly uppermost, motionless, and his four feet tightly clenched. The other animals took hold of him, and carefully drew him up on the raft. They unclosed one of his paws, then a second, then a third, and finally the fourth one, in which there was between the claws a little grain of sand.

The Great Hare, who had promised to form a broad and spacious land, took this grain of sand, and let it fall upon the raft, when it began to increase; then he took a part of it, and scattered this about, which caused the mass of soil to grow larger and larger. When it had reached the size of a mountain, he started to walk around it, and it steadily increased in size to the extent of his path. As soon as he thought it was large enough, he ordered the fox to go to inspect his work, with power to enlarge it still more; and the latter obeyed. The fox, when he ascertained that it was sufficiently extensive for him to secure easily his own prey, returned to the Great Hare to inform him that the land was able to contain and support all the animals. At this report, the Great Hare made a tour throughout his creation and found that it was incomplete. Since then, he has not been willing to trust any of the other animals, and continues always to increase what he has made, by moving without cessation around the earth. This idea causes the savages to say, when they hear loud noises in the hollows of the mountains, that the Great Hare is still enlarging the earth; they pay honours to him, and regard him as the deity who created it. Such is the information which those peoples give us regarding the creation of the world, which they believe to be always borne upon that raft. As for the sea and firmament, they assert that these have existed for all time.

This first chapter says much about Anishinabek notions of leadership and land. The Great Hare may be chief among the animals, but he is not despotic. His authority depends upon persuasion, not coercion. The dilemma of the landless animals is shared and resolved by cooperation and bravery. The point of creating land is for mutual sustenance, not personal gain. Creation is the continuing act of the Great Hare. The Anishinabek honour him as a living, creative force. Notice that in this account, there are no humans on the raft. Their genesis is described in the next chapter:

After the creation of the earth, all the other animals withdrew into the places which each kind found most suitable for obtaining therein their pasture or their prey. When the first ones died, the Great Hare caused the birth of men from their corpses, as also from those of the fishes that were found along the shores of the rivers which he had formed in creating the land. Accordingly, some of the savages derive their origins from a bear, others from a moose, and others similarly from various kinds of animals; and before they had intercourse with the Europeans they firmly believed this, persuaded that they had

their being from those kinds of creatures whose origin was as above explained. Even today the notion passes among them for undoubted truth, and if there are any of them at this time who are weaned from believing this dream, it has been only by dint of laughing at them for so ridiculous a belief. You will hear them say that their villages each bear the name of the animal which has given its people their being — as that of the crane, or the bear, or of other animals.

The Anishinabek understand themselves as descended from the first animals who participated with the Great Hare in the act of creating the land above the waters. Each of the animal progenitors helped to shape the landscape of their countries for the sustenance of their animal and human descendants:

... The Nepissings (otherwise called the Nipissiniens), Amikouas, and all their allies assert that the Amikoüas, which term means descendants of the beaver, had their origin from the corpse of the Great Beaver, whence issued the first man of that tribe; and that this beaver left Lake Huron, and entered the stream which is called the French River. They say that as the water grew too low for him, he made some dams, which are now rapids and portages. When he reached the river which has its rise in [Lake] Nepissing, he crossed it, and followed [the course of] many other small streams which he passed. He then made a small dike of earth; but, seeing that the flood of the waters penetrated it at the sides, he was obliged to build dams at intervals, in order that he might have sufficient water for his passage. Then he came to the river which flows from Outenulkamé, where he again applied himself to building dams in places where he did not find enough water where there are at the present time shoals and rapids, around which one is obliged to make portages. Having thus spent several years in his travels, he chose to fill the country with the children whom he left there, and who had multiplied wherever he had passed, laboriously engaged in the little streams which he had discovered along his route; and at last he arrived below the Calumets. There he made some dams for the last time, and, retracing his steps, he saw that he had formed a fine lake; and there he died. They believe that he is buried to the north of this lake toward the place where the mountain appears to have the shape of a beaver, and that his tomb is there; this is the reason why they call the place where he lies "the slain beaver." When those peoples pass by that place, they invoke him and blow [tobacco] smoke into the air in order to honor his memory, and to entreat him to be favorable to them in the journey they have to make.

For the Anishinabek, the Great Lakes region is more than geography. It is a spiritual landscape formed by and embedded with the regenerative potential of the First Ones who gave it form.

This creation story has shaped both Anishinabek self-understanding and their notions of territoriality and property. The following account of an 1840 Renewal Council between the Six Nations (Nahdooways) and the Anishinabek (Ojebways) demonstrates the connection between people-descended-from-animals and place:

Chief Yellowhead rose up and made a speech and exhibited the great Wampum belt of the Six Nations, and explained the talk contained in it. This Wampum was about 3 feet long and 4 inches wide. It had a row of White Wampum in the centre, running from one end to the other, and the representations of wigwams every now and then, and a large round wampum tied nearly the middle of the Belt, with a representation of the sun in the centre. Yellowhead stated that this Belt was given by the Nahdooways to the Ojebways many years ago - about the time the French first came to this country. That the great Council took place at Lake Superior - That the Nahdooways made the road or path and

pointed out the different council fires which were to be kept lighted. The first marks on the Wampum represented that a council fire should be kept burning at the Sault St. Marie. The 2nd mark represented the Council fire at the Manitoulin Island, where a beautiful White fish was placed, who should watch the fire as long as the world stood. The 3rd Mark represents the Council fire placed on an Island opposite Penetanguishene Bay, on which was placed a Beaver to watch the fire.

The 4th mark represents the Council fire lighted up at the Narrows of Lake Simcoe at which place was put a White Rein Deer. To him the Rein Deer was committed the keeping of this Wampum talk. At this place our fathers hung up the Sun, and said that the Sun should be a witness to all what had been done and that when any of their descendants saw the Sun they might remember the acts of their forefathers.

At the Narrows our fathers placed a dish with ladles around it, and a ladle for the Six Nations, who said to the Ojebways that the dish or bowl should never be emptied, but he (Yellowhead) was sorry to say that it had already been emptied, not by the Six Nations on the Grand River, but by the Caucanawaugas residing near Montreal.

The 5th Mark represents the Council fire which was placed at this River Credit where a beautiful White headed Eagle was placed upon a very tall pine tree, in order to watch the Council fires and see if any ill winds blew upon the smoke of the Council fires. A dish was also placed at the Credit. That the right of hunting on the north side of the Lake was secured to the Ojebways, and that the Six Nations were not to hunt here only when they come to smoke the pipe of peace with their Ojebway brethren.

The path on the Wampum went from the Credit over to the other side of the Lake the country of the Six Nations. Thus ended the talk of Yellowhead and his Wampum.

Chief Yellowhead was a White Rein Deer chief. He drew his authority from his fathers and grandfathers before him back to the first White Rein Deer. When he signed treaties, he drew the figure of a Rein Deer. The Beaver chiefs could point the burial mountain of the Great Beaver within their traditional territory. Land surrenders covering Beaver Country were signed by chiefs drawing Beaver marks. Genealogy and territory are fused in a spiritual landscape which has little to do with individualism, exclusivity or despotic dominion.

